Notes by David Groisser, Copyright ©1996

A terrible way to solve exact equations.

Suppose that the equation M(x, y)dx + N(x, y)dy = 0 is exact (i.e. $\partial M/\partial y = \partial N/\partial x$). In the book, and in class, we discussed a method for finding an implicit solution of the form F(x, y) = constant. Here is a **wrong** method for trying to find F. Make sure it's **not** the method you're using.

Step 1. Integrate M with respect to x, omitting constants of integration.

Step 2. Integrate N with respect to y, omitting constants of integration.

Step 3. Add the results from steps 1 and 2 together, except that if the same term (say 3xy) appears in the answers to both steps 1 and 2, only count it once instead of twice. The result of this "addition" is what you plan to call F(x, y).

The trouble is that unlike the method discussed in class and in the book, which *always* gives a solution (we proved it!), the method above *sometimes* gives a solution, and *sometimes* doesn't. (If you think that it always gives the right answer, try to prove it. Part of the problem you'll come across is deciding what you mean by a "term" in steps 1 and 2.) Would you drive a car that sometimes sped up when you hit the brakes?

Here is an example in which the method above fails:

$$(y\sin x\cos x + y) \, dx + \left(-\frac{1}{2}\cos^2 x + 3y^2 + x\right)dy = 0. \tag{1}$$

Note that $M_y = N_x = \sin x \cos x + 1$, so the equation is exact. Let's try to solve it the wrong way given above.

Step 1. Using the substitution $u = \sin x$, we find $\int M dx = \frac{1}{2}y \sin^2 x + xy$.

Step 2. We find $\int N dy = -\frac{1}{2}y\cos^2 x + y^3 + xy$.

Step 3. The answers to Steps 1 and 2 have only the term xy in common, so when we combine them we obtain $F(x, y) = \frac{1}{2}y(\sin^2 x - \cos^2 x) + xy + y^3$. This gives us the non-solution

$$\frac{1}{2}y(\sin^2 x - \cos^2 x) + xy + y^3 = c.$$
 (2)

If y(x) is a function determined implicitly by (2), then implicitly differentiating and solving for y' we find

$$y' = -\frac{2y\sin x\cos x + y}{\frac{1}{2}(\sin^2 x - \cos^2 x) + 3y^2 + x}.$$
(3)

However, a solution of (1) satisfies

$$y' = -\frac{y\sin x\cos x + y}{-\frac{1}{2}\cos^2 x + 3y^2 + x}$$

which does not equal the expression in (3).

I leave it as an exercise for you to solve (1) correctly.